So You Want to Create a Job…

Bill Shobe
Presented to
Richmond Association for Business Economics Jobs Summit
April 29, 2010
The Simple Story

- The Governor snaps his fingers
- Firms appear and need workers
- Idle workers take the jobs
- Economy grows
- Everyone is better off by the amount of added growth
- So simple
The Simple Story

- The Governor snaps his fingers
- Firms appear and need workers
- Idle workers take the jobs
- Economy grows
- Everyone is better off by the amount of added growth

- So simple *and so wrong!*
The Simple Story

- The Governor snaps his fingers
  - Every time this happens money moves from one person to another
- Firms appear and need workers
- Idle workers take the jobs
- Economy grows
- Everyone is better off by the amount of added growth
- So simple *and so wrong!*
The Simple Story

- The Governor snaps his fingers
- Firms appear and need workers
  - Firms sell their location decision to localities, who bid against each other and raise the price
- Idle workers take the jobs
- Economy grows
- Everyone is better off by the amount of added growth
- So simple *and so wrong!*
The Simple Story

- The Governor snaps his fingers
- Firms appear and need workers
- Idle workers take the jobs
  - Except in a recession, there are no idle workers. Each new hire is from some other firm, costs rise.
- Economy grows
- Everyone is better off by the amount of added growth
- So simple *and so wrong!*
The Simple Story

- The Governor snaps his fingers
- Firms appear and need workers
- Idle workers take the jobs
- Economy grows
  - Jobs are a *cost* of production. Maximizing jobs is maximizing a cost. Net growth may be negative.
- Everyone is better off by the amount of added growth
- So simple *and so wrong!*
The Simple Story

- The Governor snaps his fingers
- Firms appear and need workers
- Idle workers take the jobs
- Economy grows
- Everyone is better off by the amount of added growth
  - A greater flow of money does not imply increasing well-being. It is gross gain not net gain.

- So simple *and so wrong!*
Another Story: In Two Chapters

- Recession and Expansion

- Chapter 1: Recession
  - Slack resources, capacity utilization of labor and capital very low; disequilibrium; prices do not reflect resource scarcity

- Chapter 2: Expansion
  - No slack resources, high utilization; equilibrium; prices reflect resource scarcity
Chapter 1: Recession

- Increasing resource utilization brings undervalued resources into production
- Increasing spending can increase utilization
- How can a balanced budget state spend more?
- Borrow (If you’re squeamish, don’t listen.)
  - Deficit spending (Don’t tell Standard & Poors!)
  - Balanced budget multiplier (T-- and spend, yikes!)
  - Spend someone else’s money (Uncle Sam’s)
How the State BBM Works

- Raise $1 in taxes
- Get $0.20 in deferred private saving
- So $1 in increased taxes earns a net increase of $0.20 in current spending
- Plus, resources can be purchased cheaply for making public investments
How the State BBM Works

- Raise $1 in taxes
- Get $0.20 in deferred private saving
- So $1 in increased taxes earns a *net increase* of $0.20 in current spending
- Plus, resources can be purchased cheaply for making public investments
- Not a recommendation; I’m just sayin’
Maxing out on your federal match helps the economy.
- Raise $1 in taxes
- Earn an extra $1 in federal match
- So, a $1 in increased taxes earns a net increase of $1.00 in current spending
- Leaving federal $ on the table hurts you
Chapter 2: Expansion

The key characteristic of a private economy:
- Resources move toward their highest use through a series of price-mediated voluntary transactions
- Prices reflect the value of resources as measured by what is given up in moving resources from their current use, their “opportunity cost”
Resources in an Open Economy

- Any state policy must be understood in the context of an open economy where resources can move readily across state and local boundaries.

- Income, population, and property values depend on each other and are determined by movements of people and production.
Spatial Equilibrium

- Where prices can adjust reasonably quickly:
  - Workers must be indifferent between locations
  - Firms must be indifferent about hiring
  - Builders indifferent about supplying more housing

- This equilibrium determines local population, wages, and housing costs which depend on local productivity, amenities, and construction costs
Let’s Create Jobs!

- Given local productivity ($\alpha$), amenities ($\theta$), cost of adding housing stock ($\eta$):
- Governor pays a firm to locate in a community (evidence suggest that this is VERY costly per job created)
- Firm hires workers
- So who wins?
The New Equilibrium

- Firm bids up wages (hiring costs rise)
- Workers bid up housing (real wages fall)
- Housing expands, prices fall (wages rise)
- Migrants enter for high wages (wages fall, housing prices rise, etc.)
- Wages return to prior level, population is higher, property prices are higher
Who Gained? Who Lost?

- **Gainers:** stockholders of the firm with the subsidy, property owners, migrants into the region
- **Losers:** the original workers who now have lower real wages, renters who now have higher rents
- **What public policy goal was accomplished?**
Can We Do Better?

- Policies that improve $\theta$, $\eta$, and $\alpha$
- Amenities: safety, education, transportation, parks, air and water quality
- Housing: ease of adding new housing stock
- Productivity: effective public institutions, local entrepreneurship, and human capital, human capital, human capital
State Jobs Policy in Equilibrium

- Policy effects are determined by spatial equilibrium
  - If you don’t believe in spatial equilibrium, burn your Adam Smith and your John Locke
- “Jobs policies” have unknown and often unintended consequences
- At the margin, policies to improve $\theta$, $\eta$, and $\alpha$ are better targets for state policy
Thank you

Bill Shobe
Center for Economic & Policy Studies
Weldon Cooper Center for Public Service
University of Virginia
shobe@virginia.edu